

## Public Accounts Committee

---

Meeting Venue:  
**Committee Room 3 – Senedd**

---

Meeting date:  
**3 July 2012**

---

Meeting time:  
**09:00**

---

Cynulliad  
Cenedlaethol  
Cymru

National  
Assembly for  
Wales



For further information please contact:

**Tom Jackson**  
Committee Clerk  
029 2089 8597  
[Publicaccounts.comm@Wales.gov.uk](mailto:Publicaccounts.comm@Wales.gov.uk)

---

### Agenda

---

#### **1. Introductions, apologies and substitutions (9:00 – 9:05)**

#### **2. Papers to note** (Pages 1 – 6)

PAC(4) 14–12 – Paper 1 – Correspondence on AWEMA from the Assistant Auditor General for Wales (19 June 2012)

PAC(4) 14–12 – Paper 2 – Correspondence on AWEMA from the Chair to the Assistant Auditor General for Wales (26 June 2012)

PAC(4) 14–12 – Paper 3 – Correspondence on AWEMA from the Assistant Auditor General for Wales (27 June 2012)

Minutes of previous meeting.

#### **3. Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to resolve to exclude the public from the meeting for the following business:**

Items 4 and 5.

#### **4. Grants Management in Wales – Key themes and emerging issues (9:05 – 10:00)** (Pages 7 – 40)

#### **5. Progress in delivering the Welsh Housing Quality Standard – Key themes and emerging issues (10:00 – 11:00)** (Pages 41 – 77)



WALES AUDIT OFFICE  
SWYDDFA ARCHWILLO CYMRU

Wales Audit Office / Swyddfa Archwilio Gymru

Mr Darren Millar, AM  
Chair, Public Accounts Committee  
National Assembly for Wales  
Cardiff Bay  
Cardiff  
CF99 1NA

24 Cathedral Road / Heol y Gadeiriann  
Cardiff / Caerdydd  
CF11 9LJ  
Tel / Ffôn: 029 20 320500  
Fax / Ffacs: 029 20 320600  
Email / Epost: [wales@wao.gov.uk](mailto:wales@wao.gov.uk)  
[www.wao.gov.uk](http://www.wao.gov.uk)

Date	19 June 2012
Ref	AJB15/1am
Tel	02920 320 571
Email	<a href="mailto:anthony.barrett@wao.gov.uk">anthony.barrett@wao.gov.uk</a>
Pages	1 of 2

Dear Darren

## Wales Audit Office value for money examination: AWEMA

I am writing to provide you with a brief progress update on our current value for money study which is examining whether the Welsh Government, including the Welsh European Funding Office (WEFO), has managed its relationship with the All Wales Ethnic Minority Association (AWEMA) appropriately to protect and make good use of public funds.

In my letter of 15 February 2012, I had indicated that, acting on behalf of the Auditor General and dependent on a range of factors, I anticipated being able to publish our final report in May or June 2012. However, that timetable has proved increasingly ambitious and I can confirm that I now expect to publish our final report at the start of the National Assembly's autumn term. This extension to our study timetable will provide sufficient time for us to complete our ongoing programme of interviews and to then draft and prepare our final report for publication and translation. In line with our normal practice, this process will involve a period of clearance with the Welsh Government and other third parties as regards the factual accuracy and balance of the report.

I would emphasise that Wales Audit Office staff have been working very hard to complete what has proven to be a much more substantial programme of file reviews and interviews than we first envisaged. Although the evidence base for our work has been broadly consistent with that described in my previous letter, it is the scale of our work that means it has taken longer than expected. I can confirm that we have continued to experience full co-operation from the Welsh Government throughout our fieldwork. My study team is now nearing the point at which we will be able to step back from the process of evidence gathering in order to draw out the key findings and conclusions that will provide the basis of our report.

I should also like to take this opportunity to confirm once again the scope of our work, in light of some inaccurate recent media coverage. The Wales Audit Office has not been examining the internal workings of AWEMA itself. The responsibility for any examination of AWEMA's governance, in particular the trustees' action and decision-making in managing the charity, rests with the Charity Commission. We have also been mindful of the need to take into account the scope of any action by South Wales Police. While we are examining payments to AWEMA made by the Welsh Government and WEFO and their purpose, we are not, as has been suggested in some quarters, carrying out our own audit of AWEMA's finances.



Our interest in governance and financial management issues at AWEMA extends only to consideration of how the Welsh Government has responded throughout its relationship with AWEMA to issues or concerns that have come to its attention.

I should be grateful if you would circulate this letter to the members of your Committee, and I confirm that I would be happy for a copy of it to be placed on the Committee's website

Yours sincerely



Anthony Barrett  
Assistant Auditor General

## PAC(4)-14-12 Paper 2

### Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus Public Accounts Committee

Anthony Barrett  
Assistant Auditor General for  
Wales  
Wales Audit Office  
24 Cathedral Road  
Cardiff  
CF11 9LJ

National Assembly for Wales  
Cardiff Bay  
CF99 1NA

26 June 2012

Dear Anthony

Thank you for providing an update on the progress of the Wales Audit Office value for money study which is examining whether the Welsh Government has managed its relationship with the All Wales Ethnic Minority Association (AWEMA) appropriately. The Committee is pleased to note the progress that the Wales Audit Office has made in its investigation and we look forward to receiving the final report at the start of the autumn term.

In your letter of 19 June, you reaffirm the scope of the Wales Audit Office investigation in response to recent inaccurate media coverage.

I am grateful for this update, however I would be grateful if you could confirm that the scope of the investigation also includes:

- details of the Welsh Government's investment in AWEMA and whether it represented value for money;
- how the grants provided to AWEMA were monitored; and
- whether action undertaken by the Welsh Government in response to concerns raised about the charity has been sufficient.

I look forward to receiving your response.

Yours sincerely



**Darren Millar AM**  
Chair of the Public Accounts Committee



WALES AUDIT OFFICE  
SWYDDFA ARCHWILLO CYMRU

Wales Audit Office / Swyddfa Archwilio Gymru

Mr Darren Millar, AM  
Chair, Public Accounts Committee  
National Assembly for Wales  
Cardiff Bay  
Cardiff  
CF99 1NA

24 Cathedral Road / Heol y Gadeirlan  
Cardiff / Caerdydd  
CF11 9LJ  
Tel / Ffôn: 029 20 320500  
Fax / Ffacs: 029 20 320600  
Email / Epost: [wales@wao.gov.uk](mailto:wales@wao.gov.uk)  
[www.wao.gov.uk](http://www.wao.gov.uk)

Date 27 June 2012  
Ref AJB257/am  
Tel 02920 320 571  
Email [anthony.barrett@wao.gov.uk](mailto:anthony.barrett@wao.gov.uk)  
Pages 1 of 2

Dear Darren

### Wales Audit Office value for money examination: AWEMA

Thank you for your letter of 26 June 2012 acknowledging receipt of my letter of 19 June about our examination of the Welsh Government's relationship with the All Wales Ethnic Minority Association (AWEMA). My letter of 19 June provided an update on the progress of our work, set out my revised expectation as regards the timetable for completion of our work, and re-confirmed the scope of our work following some inaccurate media coverage.

Your letter of 26 June requested further confirmation that the scope of our work includes:

- details of the Welsh Government's investment in AWEMA and whether it represented value for money;
- how the grants provided to AWEMA were monitored; and
- whether action undertaken by the Welsh Government in response to concerns raised about the charity has been sufficient.

I do expect that our final report will include details of the Welsh Government's funding of AWEMA (the sums involved and their purpose) and evidence in relation to the adequacy of the arrangements that the Welsh Government (including the Welsh European Funding Office) had put in place to monitor its grant funding.

We have been considering the available evidence in terms of whether the Welsh Government was satisfied, and can demonstrate, that it was getting value for money from its funding of AWEMA but we are not undertaking our own evaluation of AWEMA's work.

Our report will also consider the Welsh Government's response to specific concerns raised about AWEMA at different points in time, including the concerns that emerged in late 2011.

Yours sincerely

Anthony Barrett  
Assistant Auditor General

# Public Accounts Committee

---

Meeting Venue: **Committee Room 3 – Senedd**

---

Meeting date: **Tuesday, 19 June 2012**

---

Meeting time: **09:20 – 11:00**

---

This meeting can be viewed on Senedd TV at:

[http://www.senedd.tv/archiveplayer.jsf?v=en\\_400000\\_19\\_06\\_2012&t=0&l=en](http://www.senedd.tv/archiveplayer.jsf?v=en_400000_19_06_2012&t=0&l=en)

Cynulliad  
Cenedlaethol  
Cymru

National  
Assembly for  
Wales



---

## Concise Minutes:

---

### Assembly Members:

**Mohammad Asghar (Oscar) AM**  
**Mike Hedges**  
**Julie Morgan**  
**Gwyn R Price**  
**Jenny Rathbone**  
**Aled Roberts**  
**Andrew RT Davies (Chair)**

---

### Witnesses:

**Huw Vaughan Thomas, Auditor General for Wales, Wales Audit Office**  
**Paul Dimplebee, Group Director – Performance Audit, WAO**  
**Alan Morris, Wales Audit Office**

---

### Committee Staff:

**Tom Jackson (Clerk)**  
**Daniel Collier (Deputy Clerk)**  
**Joanest Jackson (Legal Advisor)**

---

## 1. Motion to elect Temporary Chair

1.1 The Clerk requested nominations for a temporary Committee Chair under Standing Order 17.22. Mohammad Asghar nominated Andrew RT Davies, who was duly appointed for this meeting.

## 2. Introductions, apologies and substitutions

2.1 The Temporary Chair welcomed Members and members of the public.

2.2 Apologies had been received from Darren Millar, for whom Andrew RT Davies was substituting and Lyndsay Whittle.

### **3. Briefing from the Auditor General for Wales – Public Engagement in Local Government**

3.1 The Chair invited the Auditor General for Wales and Alan Morris, Group Director – Performance Audit to brief the Committee on the Wales Audit Office report Public Engagement in Local Government.

3.2 The Committee agreed to invite the WLGA to provide information on examples of public engagement exercises being undertaken by councils in Wales.

3.3 The Auditor General agreed to provide examples of good practice identified during his investigation and provide feedback on the outcomes of the Shared Learning Seminar on public engagement in Wales.

### **4. Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to resolve to exclude the public from the meeting for the following business:**

Items 5 to 7.

### **5. Options for handling Public Engagement in Local Government**

5.1 The Committee discussed its options for handling the Wales Audit Office report Public Engagement in Local Government.

### **6. Determination of witnesses for the inquiry into The Welsh Government's acquisition and action to dispose of the former River Lodge Hotel, Llangollen**

6.1 The Committee agreed which witnesses it wished to invite to provide evidence on the inquiry into The Welsh Government's acquisition and action to dispose of the former River Lodge Hotel, Llangollen.

### **7. Discussion on Members' informal information gathering on Scotland's Grants Management framework**

7.1 The Committee discussed the feedback from Members' informal information gathering on Scotland's Grants Management framework.

### **8. Papers to note**

8.1 The Committee ratified the minutes of the meeting on 12 July 2012.

### **Transcript**

By virtue of paragraph(s) vi of Standing Order 17.42

Document is Restricted

By virtue of paragraph(s) vi of Standing Order 17.42

Document is Restricted